

MINUTES OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING
Mayfield Village Main Conference Room -Mayfield Village Civic Center
6622 Wilson Mills Road, Mayfield Village, Ohio
Thursday, February 13, 2025 – 5:00 p.m.

The Civil Service Commission met on Thursday, February 13, 2025, in the Main Conference Room at the Mayfield Village Civic Center. Chairman DeBaggis called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

Present: Mr. DeBaggis
Mr. Bucci
Mr. Tarkowsky

Also Present: Chief Matias
Councilman Meyers

Approval of Minutes of Meeting of Thursday, January 30, 2025

Chairman DeBaggis stated, the Commission has received a copy of the Minutes from Thursday, January 30, 2025. Is there a motion to approve the Minutes?

Mr. Bucci, seconded by Mr. Tarkowsky, moved to approve the Minutes of the Meeting of Thursday, January 30, 2025.

Chairman DeBaggis asked, any discussion?

There was none.

ROLL CALL:	Ayes: All	Motion Carried
	Nays: None	January 30, 2025 Minutes
		Approved As Written

Police Department Update
- Promotional Examination - Lieutenant

Chairman DeBaggis asked Chief Matias to update the Commission on the request to administer a promotional examination for Lieutenant.

Chief Matias stated, I just wanted to first give the Commission a brief update on the recent patrol officer entrance examination and the Sergeant promotional entrance examination. We hired the number one candidate off of the certified list for patrol officer back in October. He is just

completing his training now. With the unexpected departure of Patrolman Zach Reiland, we have given a conditional offer to the number two candidate on the list. He is working through the hiring process right now. That list is good through July of 2025.

For the promotional examination for Sergeant, Chief Matias reported that the list is good through October. Steve Palka was recently promoted to Sergeant a few months ago. It's most likely that since that current list will be valid through October when we go to backfill the Sergeant's position following the Lieutenant promotional, we will still be able to use that list.

Chief Matias stated, I was notified late last year from Lieutenant Jablonski that he anticipates retiring in the Spring. He does not have an actual date yet. He has been a Lieutenant for 14 years. I wanted to get ahead of this and start the process for the promotional examination so that Lieutenant Jablonski has the opportunity to train him.

Chairman DeBaggis stated, the Commission was provided with some material from PRADCO including the contract. Can you tell us about PRADCO? We used them over 10 years ago, but none of us were on the Commission at the time.

Chief Matias stated, we used them back in 2009, which was actually the Sergeant's test that I was promoted off of. They are different than the other testing companies. They have a written and assessment exercise. Assessments are handled by Chiefs and former law enforcement. They are unique because they get into a lot more of the person as opposed to doing an assessment scenario-based. I found some of the test results from 2009. Even to this day when you look through them, they are spot on. They talk about motivation, leadership, work approach, interpersonal style, decision-making and judgment. They give a total score with descriptions. It is a fantastic tool to go over with the candidates to highlight the areas they need to improve on. When I got my results in 2010, I would like to think that some of the areas that I focused on helped me get to my position today.

Chief Matias stated, they perform a 5-category assessment where they talk about supporting the agency's objectives, command presence, holding others accountable, relationships and problem-solving. Each is worth up to 20 points to a total of 100. The applicants would first take an on-line assessment and then they will meet with the folks from PRADCO who specialize in this type of law enforcement public safety assessments.

We didn't use them for the Sergeant's exam because we had 8 candidates and PRADCO is on the higher end of the costs for these exams. We will have 4 eligible candidates for the Lieutenant's test. Because of the value of information PRADCO gives and the fact we have a smaller group of candidates, it is well worth the investment to work with PRADCO.

Chairman DeBaggis asked, did you contact PRADCO?

Chief Matias replied, yes.

Chairman DeBaggis asked, did you contact any other testing agencies?

Chief Matias replied, no.

Chairman DeBaggis asked, did you have a discussion with them about the price?

Chief Matias replied, yes.

Chairman DeBaggis stated, the reason why I ask is if we want to utilize an agency that is charging more than \$10,000, we would need Council approval.

Mr. Tarkowsky stated, I don't think that includes travel costs, which would be above \$9,900. Also, it states additional for transportation, lodging and meals.

Chairman DeBaggis asked, are they local?

Chief Matias replied, they are in Chagrin Falls. That quote is the total amount.

Mr. Bucci asked, is the assessment done at their location?

Chief Matias replied, yes. I can verify the travel costs. When we did it the first time there were no additional costs. I went down to their office and did it. The quote is going to be the total cost.

Chairman DeBaggis stated, the reason I ask is it is on the high end. We used another agency, Personnel Selection, he provided the same services for only \$5,000. We are trying to keep an eye on costs. With the Fire Department, we are saving a ton of money because we are administering multi-regional examinations. This proposal from PRADCO looks good, but when I got to the price on it-

Mr. Bucci asked, how many Lieutenant positions do you have?

Chief Matias replied, one.

Chairman DeBaggis asked, would you be against having another agency provide us with an estimate?

Chief Matias stated, I can get the estimate, but if the estimate comes in cheaper, I am going to still advocate for PRADCO. The Lieutenant's position is a very important position on the department. Not diminishing my Sergeants, it's something I took into account. I originally wanted to use PRADCO for the Sergeant promotional. They have some cheaper options for front-line supervisor promotional examinations, but it didn't provide the detailed information that the advanced supervisory promotions would provide.

Mr. Bucci asked, is the main reason the coaching element, besides the person you are going to hire, you get a lot of feedback on the other candidates and how they can make themselves stronger in the future?

Chief Matias replied, yes. The information we got in 2009 out of these, in looking at the assessments and knowing the people they were done on, including myself, it was fantastic data. I think for the Lieutenant's position, for as important as that position is, it would be worth the investment. It would have been for the Sergeants as well, but with 8 candidates, the cost would have been almost \$20,000.

Mr. Bucci asked, do they specialize in safety forces?

Chief Matias replied, yes. They do pre-hire assessments with a psychological component. They do a lot of different assessments. They even handle dispatch.

Mr. Bucci asked, do you know if a lot of the other departments locally are using them?

Chief Matias replied, I don't know. Dr. Borkin is a member of the Cuyahoga County Chiefs of Police Association.

Mr. Tarkowsky asked, so you said you have four candidates. If you have less than four who want to take the examination, does that price then go down?

Chief Matias replied, yes. That price is based off of four candidates. If we have less than four candidates, they will adjust the price.

Chief Matias handed out of the assessments from 2009 for the Commission's review. They also do coaching programs for career development.

Chairman DeBaggis asked, what are the daily duties of a Lieutenant in your department?

Chief Matias passed around a draft of the job description for Lieutenant for the Commission's review.

Mr. Tarkowsky asked, in comparison to a Sergeant, how are the duties different?

Chief Matias replied, the Sergeants run the shifts. They work the 12 hour rotations. They are in charge of the actual patrol shift. They have other collateral duties, but their main function is they are on the road and managing –

Mr. Tarkowsky asked, so managing the individual officers? The Lieutenant is managing the whole department?

Chief Matias replied, yes.

Mr. Tarkowsky stated, so the duties are a lot different?

Chief Matias replied, right.

Mr. Tarkowsky stated, so you may want a more thorough exam. If they were more similar, you would have a good idea who you would want to hire.

Chief Matias replied, actually I don't.

Mr. Tarkowsky stated, that's what I am saying.

Chief Matias stated, one of the reasons I like PRADCO is I have been thinking about this for quite some time. When you look at each of the four candidates, each one of them has their own particular strengths and weaknesses in different areas for what they are doing right now. I have worked on the job description for a while putting together what would be best for our department and Mayfield Village. It's not who I want. I am not going to be here 5-10-20 years from now. A lot of the candidates are going to be here. I am looking longer term what we need for the position. It's hard for me to predict how they will act in that role. It's a lot different from a Sergeant, which I learned when I became Chief. I believe the information from PRADCO helped prepare me for the position I am in now.

Chief Matias stated, the reason I advocate for PRADCO is because I am familiar with it. I have seen the results. I know how it has impacted me.

Chairman DeBaggis stated, coming in here after reviewing the materials I felt that at that price I might ask that you get another quote. You are doing a good job trying to talk me out of it. I don't know how the other members feel about it.

Mr. Bucci stated, in my previous job, we had similar assessments for a lot of the hired positions. I found they were very valuable when you are considering internal candidates. You know the people already. We sometimes use a mix and use the outside. They don't do as well when you have outside candidates you don't know.

Chief Matias stated, if you read the last section about this candidate, I think it paints a good picture.

Mr. Bucci stated, I had a similar experience. I went through one of those processes. They were about 90% correct.

Chairman DeBaggis asked, Mr. Meyers, do you have anything you would like to add on this conversation?

Mr. Meyers stated, no, I do but I don't. Money is money. From Council, I don't want to see just one quote. I have to see a couple. Even if you get a quote that's \$6,000 and these people are way more capable and qualified, maybe it is the right choice.

Chief Matias stated, I can get quotes, but again, I will just come back to saying that I am familiar with PRADCO. I have seen their results. If I get other quotes, they are probably going to be cheaper and I am going to have no idea what kind of information they are really going to be able to provide me. We have already used PRADCO. The results from the previous promotional administered by them are spot-on.

Mr. Bucci stated, your report was prepared in 2009. That's a long time ago. The same people, we do not know if they are still there or not.

Chief Matias replied, several of the same people are there yes. I guess I'm just concerned that if we were going to make the decision based on money and I get other quotes and they are cheaper; but if that's the way we have to go.

Mr. Bucci stated, they did a thorough job on the report. Who knows what others will do?

Chairman DeBaggis stated, I think we should have one or two more proposals and decide from there. If PRADCO is the best one, we will go with PRADCO. It would be nice to have a choice.

Chief Matias stated, okay. I'll take care of it.

Chairman DeBaggis stated, I'm sorry. We are supporting you 100%. Maybe you could go back to PRADCO and see what else we can choose from.

Chief Matias stated, I don't feel you are not supporting me. I just want to be clear that my position isn't going to change. I will get you the quotes.

Chairman DeBaggis stated, you shouldn't say that. You should keep an open mind. Someone might submit a proposal that is twice as good as PRADCO and you didn't know about them and they put a great proposal together and it's half the cost. You don't know.

Mr. Bucci stated, when you get the quote see if they can give you some type of sample report.

Chief Matias stated, I understand. I don't want to keep beating a dead horse, but the sample reports I have from PRADCO are on actual people who have worked or do work for the department. They can give me a sample, but I don't know how good it is going to be. I'll do it. I'll keep an open mind.

Mr. Bucci asked, who did we use for the Sergeant's test?

Chief Matias replied, we used I/O Solutions for the written and we used the Ohio Association of Chiefs of Police for the assessment.

Mr. Bucci asked, do either one of them administer a Lieutenant promotional?

Chief Matias replied, sure.

Mr. Bucci stated, maybe you could get information from them.

. **Fire Department Update**

Chairman DeBaggis stated, Chief Carcioppolo was unable to attend this meeting, however he asked me to pass along to the Commission that they are in the final process of hiring an entry level firefighter/paramedic.

. **Service Department Update**

Chairman DeBaggis stated, Service Director Frank Stupczy has nothing to report.

ANY OTHER MATTERS

Chairman DeBaggis asked, are there any other matters to come before the Commission? At this point, we will wait, Chief for you to let Mrs. Betsa know that you have a couple other proposals and then we will reschedule the meeting of the Commission hopefully soon.

Chief Matias stated, with the quotes I get, I don't plan on administering a written examination. The assessment centers will be adequate for what we are looking to do.

Chairman DeBaggis stated, I agree.

Mr. Tarkowsky asked, so you just want an interview-type assessment?

Chief Matias replied, yes.

Chairman DeBaggis asked, anything else, gentlemen?

Chief Matias reported, retired Detective Sergeant Don Smith passed away on Monday. Once an obituary is posted, I will share that with the Village through e-mail.

Chairman DeBaggis stated, okay.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further matters, Mr. Tarkowsky, seconded by Mr. Bucci, made a motion to adjourn the meeting. The meeting was adjourned at 5:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary E. Betsa, MMC, Secretary