ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MEETING MINUTES Mayfield Village May 13, 2021

The Architectural Review Board met in regular session on Thurs, May 13, 2021 at 6:00 p.m. **remotely, via electronic means**. Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann presided.

ROLL CALL

Present:

Mr. Steve Varelmann Chairman Pro Tem Mr. John Marrelli, Building Commissioner

Dr. Jim Triner Ms. Deborah Garbo, Secretary

Mr. Tom Lawler Mr. Jeff Thomas, IT Systems Coordinator

Mr. Matt Phillips

Absent:

Mr. Carmen Miozzi Chairman

This meeting has been duly noticed and is being held in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22 specific to recent amendments made in light of the current COVID-19 declared emergency (House Bill 197-amended by House Bill 404). Under the orders of Governor DeWine, the Architectural Review Board is meeting remotely, via electronic means.

The public is invited to view the meeting live and can access the meeting through a link posted on the Mayfield Village website at www.mayfieldvillage.com. The public was encouraged to view this meeting agenda and offer any comments or questions prior to the meeting to be read into the record and addressed at the meeting.

CONSIDERATION OF MEETING MINUTES: April 22, 2021

Consideration of minutes moved to next meeting date.

PROPOSALS

1. Addition & Alterations Tim Palermo

7097 Wilson Mills Rd.

Contractor: R & K Renovations

2. Alterations Philip Gaeta

6764 Bonnieview Rd.

Contractor: Gaeta Interiors

OPEN PORTION

Tim Palermo 7097 Wilson Mills Rd. Addition & Alterations

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann called the meeting to order. First on the agenda is an addition and alterations for Tim Palermo, 7097 Wilson Mills Rd. We have the drawings up and we'll do a brief overview starting with sheet #4.

Sheet #4 Floor Plan

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, the areas I think we're looking at are, to the left a 1st floor new addition which is New Bedroom 110, there're 3 windows in the middle that are new. Then we have a 2nd floor Master Bedroom, I'm not clear on that in relation to the 1st floor. Mr. Palermo is this existing?

Tim Palermo replied, it is existing, it's located over the garage. It was an addition the original homeowner did. I don't know the details as to when it was done.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann asked, are you changing the exterior appearance with windows in that area?

Tim Palermo replied, all the windows are to be replaced, yes. There's a window schedule on the prints you have.

Sheet #6 Elevation

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, this is the west elevation, the portion to the right is the addition and then adjacent to that the 3 windows being replaced, there're not currently 3 windows there now, it's a different configuration. We have shingle samples here, any other material samples? Does the owner or contractor want to say anything about the project?

Tim Palermo replied, not really other than we're looking forward to getting in rolling. Russ, do you have anything you'd like to add?

Russ Madak replied, no.

Dr. Triner said, the windows on the new section, if you notice, the windows are symmetrical in the original architecture and they're kind of lopsided in the new addition. I don't know whether they can be moved to be more symmetrical. It makes the back of the house not look architecturally balanced.

Tim Palermo replied, are you saying you'd like to see this one closest to the original structure moved in?

Dr. Triner replied yes, something to make it balanced. The windows have a pretty nice balance and then all of a sudden you have that right section and they just look like they were stuck in there.

Tim Palermo replied, we can easily move them wherever you guys would like to see them, nothing's framed yet. It's not a big deal.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann echo's Jim's concern. In addition, when I look at the existing building, the way the architectural drawings are drawn, they don't really represent the way the windows actually are, especially the middle section. Let's move to the photographs, if you look at that middle section with the window, it's not represented like that in the drawing. If you go back to the dwg, you'll see the window shown is a more narrow window, back to the photograph, you'll see that window shown is more squarish. It's not being represented correctly. In addition to Jim's concern about how they're looking, they really don't have a composition that represents a holistic design idea, my concern is they may not even look like this when you build it. I have low confidence in these drawings.

Tim Palermo said, we'll have her redraft it.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, where the windows are, you're not showing the sills. If you look at the photos, these have brick sills and the rake board has a little return on it. Back to the dwg, it doesn't show that type of thing. It's not really accurate in representation of what we're supposed to approve. Those are my primary concerns. Anybody else have any comments or questions?

Brick & Siding Paint Colors

Mr. Phillips asked about colors of the new siding.

Tim Palermo replied, all the brick's going to be painted white. The wood siding that you see above the original addition, the new addition is going to be compared to that and then painted a middle tone gray.

Mr. Lawler asked, is the finish on the existing windows black as well?

Tim Palermo replied, the existing windows have no black to them whatsoever. All the windows will be replaced.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, I think we need to see samples of all the finishes that you're changing; paint sample colors. Are you using vinyl windows, do you know what color?

Mr. Lawler replied, vinyl double hung in the schedule. I tend to agree with the lopsided balance on the bedroom windows. I think they could be adjusted to be balanced like Jim mentioned. Did we talk about downspouts on the new addition?

Mr. Lawler asked, are you going to match the soffits with the vinyl?

Tim Palermo replied, that soffit's all to be replaced with white vinyl. Up underneath there, that's all rotted out under that current soffit.

Mr. Lawler said, there's all these brick sills here, are those all going away with the window replacement or are those staying? It looks like you have sandstone sills.

Tim Palermo replied, I would assume those are staying and just being painted white based off the configuration of the new window.

Mr. Marrelli asked, are you going to paint the sandstone?

Tim Palermo replied, I would think so unless you guys have an issue with that.

Mr. Marrelli said, there's no way to paint brick that it'll stay on there. Once you seal the brick with paint then you end up with a moisture problem inside because the house doesn't breathe anymore.

Dr. Triner asked, you're going to paint all this brick white?

Mr. Marrelli said, I don't think that's a good idea, but I don't have a vote.

Mr. Lawler asked, are you putting new sandstone sills in the new windows as well to match?

Tim Palermo replied yes, we would configure the new windows to fit the existing.

Mr. Lawler said, I don't think the sandstone sills are shown on the new windows. What we would typically expect for the new windows is to match the look of any of the existing openings. So if you're going to retain the sandstone sills, we would look for sandstone sills at the new windows as well to match the existing, the same profile edge as all the others.

Mr. Marrelli asked, what happens to the stone in the front, are you going to paint that too?

Tim Palermo replied, yes Sir.

Mr. Lawler said, the ultimate goal here is that your addition doesn't look like an addition, it looks like an original piece of the structure, that's the ultimate goal here.

Mr. Marrelli said, but Tom if you think about it, imagine all of the brick painted, all the stone painted-

Mr. Lawler said, I agree, I was just trying to take this thing step by step. I completely agree that painting all the brick, in my opinion is a mistake.

Mr. Marrelli said, the whole house is going to be white.

Mr. Lawler said, I would strongly recommend tabling this. What's the desire to paint it white? Is it just the color that you want? Is there an issue with the brick?

Tim Palermo replied, the brick is not consistent in its look across the home. It varies in tone throughout and we don't think that the look of it is very appealing as it currently is.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann asked, in the photo, are you keeping that curbed portion of the roof where it comes out on that edge of the garage?

Tim Palermo replied, I don't believe there's any changes to that in the prints.

Mr. Lawler asked, are you planning to paint the stone as well?

Tim Palermo replied, we were intending to paint the stone. Obviously if that's something you guys would like to see done differently, we can look at other options.

Mr. Lawler said, I think the stone looks good how it is. I don't think you need to refinish that unless you just don't like the stone. I would not recommend painting the stone.

Mr. Marrelli said, that's going to be a maintenance nightmare, it won't last but maybe a couple years then it's going to start flaking off and then you're going to be upset because we're going to tell you that you need to keep repainting it. Just like when people paint their chimneys and then they wish they never did.

Dr. Triner added, and you'll never get it out of the pores of the brick.

Mr. Marrelli said, once you do that you've basically ruined the brick and you've ruined the stone.

Dr. Triner said, a comment was made that the stone is uneven in color. Could that be sandblasted to match?

Mr. Lawler said Jim, I think he's saying the brick, not the stone. There does appear to be areas where the brick was patched.

Mr. Marrelli said, I don't see anything on the front or the side that looks horrible, maybe it's the back that's the issue. The back of the garage, right? You could side over that.

Mr. Lawler said, instead of painting all the brick, I'm thinking if you can try to identify any major problem areas where you don't like the mismatch brick and maybe clad some new siding over those limited areas and then leave the rest of the brick. That would save you all that painting cost.

Tim Palermo said, the brick everywhere on the house, the whole house does not look good, it's inconsistent throughout. Even if you look at that middle section, it isn't consistently colored throughout the house.

Mr. Lawler said, that's natural for brick to have some discolored bricks mixed in there.

Tim Palermo said, I see homes with painted brick all across Cleveland. I don't think it's a poor or chintzy look.

Mr. Marrelli said, so this whole house will be white then basically.

Tim Palermo replied, no. The siding above that 1 x 5, we intend to paint an offset of gray and the gutters around the back of the addition.

Mr. Marrelli said, but all the trim around the windows and the gutters and everything will be white, it's going to be like a blank piece of paper.

Mr. Phillips said, on the drawing it says the trim's going to be black, gutters black.

Dr. Triner said, I know they make stain for concrete, I don't know whether that would work on something like this or not to give it a more consistent color, that would kind of blend it in to be more of the same look. I personally think it's a mistake to be painting over brick.

Mr. Marrelli said, I agree.

Mr. Lawler said, all the painted brick I see are generally dark tones. I don't know that I've seen white brick painted.

Mr. Marrelli said, I've seen chimneys painted white and they usually get stained and then they peel, especially if you try to do it with some kind of latex, and then your house is trying to breathe and it pushes the paint off from the inside when the moisture tries to get out.

Mr. Lawler asked, do we have other items we want to add here? I'm thinking I'm going to make a motion to table in a minute, specifically for;

- See material samples
- Address window sills
- Look at the layout on the 3 windows in the addition.
- Reconsider the paint, try to find an alternative solution. If you're going to stick with the paint, an alternate color than white is recommended.

Mr. Marrelli said, I think we should probably investigate the type of paint that's going to go on there that's got some kind of a history of adhesion.

Dr. Triner said, you could put a cement sealer to seal cinder block and stuff like that and stone. The same companies make a stain specifically for brick and stone & cement. You might want to

investigate what's available there. There's an excellent company just south of here that specializes in architectural finishes for brick and stone work. It's not paint, it's a chemical reaction with the stone itself and brick.

Tim Palermo said, we'll provide you with samples.

Mr. Marrelli asked Tim, is it your plan to get the house back in some kind of condition and then sell it or are you staying?

Tim Palermo replied, we're selling the home.

Mr. Marrelli said, so it's a flip pretty much then.

Mr. Lawler said, the paint worries me even more because we have no idea or confidence that the homeowner's might have the good of the maintenance that's required on this paint down the line.

Mr. Marrelli said, we'll have to answer to the next owner as to why we approved that and how come it's doing what it's doing now.

Foundation Wall

Mr. Lawler asked about the exposed foundation wall on the elevation. I don't see it on the photos, but it's shown on the drawing. Is that going to be just at the addition?

Tim Palermo replied, John had already pointed that out. I went back to our Architect to make an amendment to put the brick all around the exposed foundation wall. She just wanted to hold off until this meeting today to see exactly how you guys wanted it worded in the amendment she's making to the prints. But, based off of this meeting, she's obviously making a lot of amendments. I'll make sure that's included, but it will be brick because the current home has brick to grade, so we'll wrap the new foundation on the addition with brick.

Dr. Triner said, I just looked up a reference on brick and I guess you can stain brick that's permanent. It says if you paint brick, you can expect to repaint it every 3-5 years.

Mr. Lawler asked, is your existing siding 6"?

Tim Palermo replied, it's either 1 x 5 or 1 x 6 Sir, I'm not sure.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, some of the siding it looks like it might be an older Masonite type siding, the existing. Are you planning on replacing any of that where it looks like its absorbed the water and it's deteriorating? I can see some of that in the photographs.

Tim Palermo replied, what needs to be replaced, we'll replace but based off of what we saw out there it didn't look like any of it needed to be replaced.

Dr. Triner said, you indicated that the soffits were rotting out, have you identified why those are rotting out?

Tim Palermo replied no, but when we replace them, we'll identify it. The whole roof is getting replaced so whatever lack of air is getting through there currently or whatever the issue, it'll be exposed once we actually get the roof off.

Dr. Triner said, you might have to replace a lot of the sheathing up there too.

Tim Palermo said, that's always a possibility, for sure.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann asked, are you planning on removing this tree that's growing right against the house?

Tim Palermo replied, no.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann asked, does the house have a basement?

Tim Palermo replied, not on that wall right there Sir.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann asked if any other questions or comments. There were none.

DECISION

Mr. Lawler, seconded by Dr. Triner made a motion to Table the Addition & Alterations proposal for Tim Palermo at 7097 Wilson Mills Rd. Follow up items for next meeting date;

- Windows & the sill at the bottom getting rid of or keeping?
- Balancing the windows across the back of the house to be more accurate to existing.
- Brick & siding paint samples and/or other paint options.
- Roofing sample
- Vinyl soffit sample
- Picture of the cut sheet of the windows.
- Update Architectural drawings for accurate representation of the project, i.e. sills, trim, footers, foundation wall.
- Light fixtures represented on drawing with cut sheets.

ROLL CALL

Ayes: All

Nays: None **Motion Carried**

TABLED

Philip Gaeta 6764 Bonnieview Rd. Alterations

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, our next proposal is alterations for Philip Gaeta at 6764 Bonnieview Rd. This appears to be just revisions to the exterior of the house, currently it looks like there's brick and they're going to go over the brick with vinyl siding. They're going to add a stone veneer. On the photograph, the right side of the existing house, it looks like there's existing stone, that's going to remain. It looks like you're going to go around the base of the foundation with stone to match that. New white windows.

Phil Gaeta corrected, no new windows.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, it says all new & existing aluminum trim & window frames to be white. What is new?

Phil Gaeta replied, the windows are existing. We're going to do the soffits with new aluminum and vinyl in white.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann asked, are you wrapping the gutter board with aluminum?

Phil Gaeta replied, the gutter board will be aluminum, the underside will be ventilated vinyl.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, I just have to ask, why are you going to go over brick with vinyl siding?

Mr. Lawler said, your brick looks great.

Phil Gaeta replied, it's not a color that we like in any way and we want to update the house to go with some of the houses that are adjacent to ours. It's pretty much bright orange when you're here. This versus painting or staining which are not good options.

Mr. Lawler asked the color of the siding.

Phil Gaeta said, you have a siding sample there, it's called night shade.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann holds up the siding and stone base sample. The existing vertical siding is going to be the same color as the siding?

Phil Gaeta replied, correct.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, we're going to have a lot of darkness on your house and then there's some white. Could you walk me through everything that's going to have white?

Phil Gaeta replied, the overhead garage door white, the trim around it is white, all of the windows will remain white, gutters white, soffits white.

Mr. Marrelli asked about the front door.

Phil Gaeta replied, the front door is currently a darker stained itself, but there's a storm door on there.

Mr. Marrelli said Matt, that's how your house is, isn't it, dark siding with the white contrast.

Mr. Phillips replied, yes, the dark with the white.

Mr. Lawler asked, are you sheathing all the brick to install the siding?

Phil Gaeta replied, we're going to fur the siding out with 2 x 4's turned sideways, flat.

Mr. Lawler asked, are you going to have trouble at your door, how are you going to return it?

Phil Gaeta replied, we'll probably wrap that in white aluminum around the door.

Mr. Lawler asked, like an outside corner trim?

Phil Gaeta replied, yes.

Mr. Lawler asked, do you know what you're going to fur it out with? You're going to need something that shoots into the brick with a good pullout strength.

Phil Gaeta replied, there'll be 2 x 4's, so we'll be using a masonry nailing gun and probably some Tapcons as well.

Mr. Lawler said, plus the siding, you're going to be maybe 2 inches furred out there at the finish. You might need a whole new trim around your entire garage door there too.

Phil Gaeta replied, correct. I plan on changing that out, right now it's currently aluminum.

Dr. Triner asked, what does the side of the house look like?

Phil Gaeta replied, all brick.

Mr. Marrelli asked, what happens on the corner when you fur out the front, are you going to wrap the corner too?

Phil Gaeta replied, on the right side where we currently have the aluminum vertical, we're going to have to wrap that side corner in and we're probably going to have to put a white trim or a trim to match the night shade of the siding.

Mr. Marrelli asked, how about the brick garage when you fur that out 1 ½, 2 inches, what's going to happen on the corner there on the return?

Phil Gaeta replied, on the corner on the left it'll go around the side of the house, it'll be a corner trim to match the siding.

Mr. Marrelli asked, how far back are you going to go down the side?

Phil Gaeta replied, we're going to wrap the entire house in vinyl siding.

Mr. Marrelli said, so that whole side of the garage that we're not seeing right now is also going to get furred out and wrapped.

Phil Gaeta replied, correct.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, I'm not familiar with the vinyl siding detail that allows you to just put the vinyl siding directly over the furring strips. I'm familiar with the method where you have furring strips, sheathing, some type of house wrap, then vinyl siding. So, if you think there is a detail that is approved by a manufacturer where you go directly over the furring, I would like to see that before we approve this.

Phil Gaeta said, okay. We were going to use insulated panels also in between the 2 x 4's.

Mr. Marrelli asked, structural or insulation panels?

Phil Gaeta replied, insulation panels. We don't currently have too much insulation in our existing house.

Mr. Lawler said, the other thing to consider, you said you're going to turn your furring material flat. I don't know what type of board you're getting, so you might want to consider the depth of that 2-by with those insulation panels if it's going to return it flat.

Mr. Marrelli replied, you're probably going to get a 1" board on there. When you go to try to fasten the siding, what are you fastening it to, a styrofoam?

Phil Gaeta replied, we'll fasten it to the 2 x 4's.

Mr. Marrelli said, that spacing might not be right for the vinyl siding. What if they call for 12" on center and you're 16"?

Phil Gaeta replied, then we'll put them 12" on center.

Mr. Lawler said, you're going to have a problem with your insulated panels if you have to reduce your spacing.

Phil Gaeta said, we can cut them to fit in between those spaces.

Mr. Lawler said, I'm just trying to help you think through this a little bit because I think there's a lot of labor involved in some of these things that you might not have considered.

Dr. Triner asked, how about moisture barriers, will there be any problem with that with the Styrofoam over the brick?

Phil Gaeta replied, I'm not aware of any. We certainly can use a Tyvek type product over it to avoid that issue.

Mr. Marrelli said, I'm just a little bit concerned on the point Steve brought up, it's when you go to nail this vinyl siding up, what are you nailing it to? Usually there's a full sheet of plywood behind it and you can nail right to the plywood anywhere you need to go.

Phil Gaeta replied, right and we could do that if we need to. We figured with the spacing we'd have enough nailer on each 2 x 4 because they're 3 ½" wide.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, I think I go back to what the manufacturer recommends, the detail that the manufacturer recommends. To John's point, where there's a lap, the joints in vinyl siding, they may not end up right on the furring, the joints in how they line up and things like that.

Mr. Marrelli said, you don't want it to end up wavy because you haven't fastened it properly.

Phil Gaeta said, I'm not opposed to putting the plywood on if that's what we need. I realize it's a unique installation.

Mr. Lawler said, I would probably feel comfortable saying approved as noted and making sure John gets a copy of that siding detail and approves it.

Phil Gaeta said, we can get that for you.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, I would agree with you Tom, I just want to be confident that John gets the details and installation recommendations from the manufacturer on this type of installation because this is unique.

Mr. Marrelli said, in the old days they used to put furring strips over the wood siding on the old houses and then they would nail steel siding to it. That's kind of what I think Phil's looking to do, but I don't think it works for the vinyl siding.

Phil Gaeta asked, so your feeling is that plywood would probably solve that issue?

Mr. Marrelli replied, I think the manufacturer is going to ask for a solid substrate I believe behind there for vinyl.

Mr. Lawler said, you won't necessarily need plywood, that could get expensive. You might be able to use a higher grade OSB or something.

Phil Gaeta replied, understood. I'll talk to the siding manufacturer and get that recommendation and get it over to you.

Mr. Marrelli said, you might be able to eliminate the 2×4 situation all together if you get a wood product, like an ½" OSB and cut it around everything and you would only have that ½" to deal with instead of a $1 \frac{1}{2}$ " or 2".

Phil Gaeta said, that's true.

Chairman Pro Tem Varelmann said, but he wants to insulate.

Mr. Marrelli said that's true, you could lose that part.

Phil Gaeta said right, I would lose the insulation.

Mr. Marrelli said, let's see what the manufacturer thinks is the proper way of putting a backer on the vinyl.

Dr. Triner said, some of the manufacturers also want you to wrap underneath them too so you don't get a moisture coming in.

Phil Gaeta replied yes, wrap the Tyvek underneath.

Dr. Triner said, I think it would be good to get the details before we approve it.

Mr. Lawler said, I feel like we've seen the finishes, we've seen what it's going to look like, I think it's more of a building concern that John could certainly handle.

Mr. Marrelli said, it's an installation issue, it's not an aesthetic issue.

DECISION

Mr. Lawler, seconded by Mr. Varelmann made a motion to approve the Alterations for Philip Gaeta at 6764 Bonnieview Rd. as noted;

• John Marrelli to approve the manufacturers installation recommendations on the vinyl siding.

ROLL CALL

Ayes: Mr. Varelmann, Dr. Triner, Mr. Lawler, Mr. Phillips

Nays: None Motion Carried

Drawings Approved as Noted.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Mr. Lawler, seconded by Dr. Triner made a motion to adjourn the meeting.

Ayes: All Nays: None	Motion Carried Meeting adjourned at 6:45 p.m.	
Chairman	Secretary	